Hiring Excellence
Search Committee Training – FY23

Presented by Kathleen Feighny, HR

hr@mines.edu
recruitment@mines.edu
Participation guidelines

Participate

- Be open, honest, respectful, candid and collaborative
- Be respectful of everyone’s stories and acknowledge how they impact our experiences
- There is no question you can't ask
- Please keep your cameras on when possible
- Use chat
Introductions

Name → Department → Year Hired at Mines → Search Committee
Equal Pay for Equal Work (EPEW)

- No longer ask about salary history
- Post all openings for a minimum of 5 days
- Interview a minimum of two qualified candidates
- No out-of-state hires
- Matching experience, qualifications and capabilities to job essentials
- Salary range must be posted
Objectives

- Understand the goals of Hiring Excellence
- Discuss the 5 phases of hiring
- Articulate the importance of Diversity & Inclusion at Mines
- Use Technology - MS Teams and Feedback Forms
- Understand how HR can help
- Review PageUp
Activity

• Share what you remember about your hiring process at Mines or somewhere else.
• What was positive?
• What could be improved?

“I was left at DIA.”

“Communication was excellent.”

“I needed more breaks.”

“Offer was slow.”

“I was left at DIA.”

“Mines did an amazing job welcoming me.”

“I could see the names of the short list on the white board behind the interviewers and I was not the top candidate.”
Recruitment Satisfaction Survey

• I did not know I needed to prepare a brief presentation.
• Please address me by my preferred name
• The zoom link for the meeting was only in 1 email (and not on jobs.mines.edu) that wasn't well-differentiated giving me a last-minute scramble to find the link
• Provide a little more notice about next steps
• If the applicants are allowed to prepare a short presentation (about 7-10 minutes), it would improve the hiring process since the search committee can understand the applicants' area of research better.
• During the interview, the screens of some of the committee members were dull on Zoom. Improving the internet infrastructure is important for the motivation of the interviewer.
• All was good, except for the fact that I was only given one interview date option.
Mines Hiring Excellence

A training program for recruiters and hiring teams to hire the best talent to Mines

- Broaden Mines’ talent pool and attract qualified diverse talent
- Support teams in making the best hiring decisions
- Hire faculty to contribute to Mines@150 & our DI&A Strategic Plan
- Build awareness of inclusive hiring practices

Academic Year 2020 – 2021

Hired 34 academic faculty – 53% female and 21% URG
Our Strategic Plan & Commitment

Goals:

• Attract, retain, graduate & promote students, faculty, staff
• Cultivate an inclusive campus culture
• Inspire shared responsibility for DI&A
Compare 2019-2020 hires to 2021-2022 hires:

- **Number of faculty members who identify as female**: +23%
- **Number of URG**: +17%
Academic Faculty

Academic Affairs informs HR of approved faculty lines

Requisition, Ad text and committee composition approved by DH, Dean, and HR

Search Chair, Committee and Recruiter create outreach strategy. Ads posted.

Short list is created by HR and Committee. Use approved hiring rubric.

First round interviews with search committee. No outside input.

Formalize committee recommendation of three finalists. Send memo to DH, Dean, HR. Request reference letters.

Interview three final candidates with entire department. Use eval form for feedback.

DH calls department meeting. Search committee shares recommendation. All faculty discuss. Secret ballot if consensus cannot be reached.

Final candidate interview with President and Provost - on campus.
Administrative Faculty/Research Faculty

1. Hiring manager contacts their TAP when a backfill/new position is needed.
2. Position description is reviewed/created for exemption and salary range.
3. Hiring manager creates requisition for approvals.
4. TAP posts the position for a minimum of five (5) days.
5. TAP reviews all applications and sends hiring manager the top 15-20 applicants.
6. Hiring manager provides TAP with names of who they want to pre-screen and interview and the TAP sends invitations.
7. TAP reviews all applications and sends hiring manager the top 15-20 applicants.
8. Hiring manager notifies TAP of finalist for offer. TAP will initiate the offer card and send for approvals.
9. Offer is made to the candidate by the TAP and the written offer is then sent to the candidate.
10. The TA team will initiate the background check and once cleared, MAPS and IT initiate onboarding paperwork.
Classified Staff

- Hiring manager contacts their TAP when a backfill/new position is needed
  - TAP creates the requisition and starts the approval process
  - Requisition is approved and TAP sets up an intake call with the hiring manager

- TAP posts the position for a minimum of five(5) days

- Subject Matter Experts score candidates in NeoGov
  - Top 6 are referred for interview by TAP
  - TAP posts the position

- SME's interview top candidates
  - Hiring manager notifies TAP of who they’d like to offer. TAP will initiate the offer card and send for approvals
  - Offer is made to the candidate by the TAP and the written offer is then sent to the candidate

recruitment@mines.edu
5 Phases of Hiring

- Plan & Launch
- Advertise & Outreach
- Assess & Interview
- Hiring Decisions
- Onboard
Phase 1- Plan & Launch a Search
Compliance

- Enrich the applicant pool to be inclusive of all groups during the outreach phase.

- Equal employment opportunity means that all individuals must be treated equally in all employment decisions including at all stages of the recruitment process.

- Each applicant must be evaluated solely on the basis of his or her ability to perform the duties of the position without regard to race, color, religion, sex, national origin, age, disability, veteran status, sexual orientation, or gender identity.

- All documentation subject to audit.
Plan & Launch

• Multi-year Mines@150 strategic planning for hires: cluster hires, opportunity hires, regular faculty search
• Ensure diverse backgrounds and perspectives on all search committees
• Identify timeline
• Drafting the job posting: use inclusive language
• Engage the entire department
Hiring Excellence: Postings

Best practices for faculty hiring and recruitment include diversifying the candidate pool, employing criteria to judge all applicants before the interview stage, designing criteria for hires with strategic vision in mind, and gaining insights into decision-making, and hiring all candidates respectfully and equally. Successful searches will be able to discern that candidates contribute to the goals of Mines’ graduate research, teaching, and diversity.

Ad Template

Colorado School of Mines is known globally for the quality of its distinctive graduates, the success of its alumni and its unique expertise in topics related to earth, energy and the environment. Our core values include Innovation, Inspiration, Challenge, Openness, Respect, Diversity, Collaboration and Communication. Each of the values above facilitates our shared success, and the advancement of Mines and its mission; by our examples and by our encouragement we seek to foster these values into our campus community, and especially among our students, so as to inspire them to pursue excellence in their goals and life endeavors. For more information visit https://www.mines.edu/dean/diversity

Total Rewards: Mines is excited to offer competitive salary, benefits, and a flexible work environment. Diversity and inclusion at Mines is committed to access, inclusion, and diversity and is actively developing strategies to advance diversity, inclusion, and access. To access our diversity statement visit https://www.mines.edu/about/diversity-and-inclusion/

Tips: Writing Effective Ads

What kind of language will best attract your ideal candidate? What are the key points of your mission statement? What are your main programs? What are your core values? Consider your audience: are they early-career scholars, experienced professionals, or people who are unsure about their professional goals?

Recruitment@mines.edu

Teaching Statement: Mines is growing its online MS complexity degree programs. We are committed to high-quality, exciting online instruction. In addition to your teaching philosophy and expertise, describe any experience you have in online education.

Equal Opportunity/Affirmative Action: Mines is an Equal Opportunity/Affirmative Action employer and educator that recognizes diversity is crucial to its pursuit of excellence in learning and research. Mines is committed to developing student, faculty, and staff populations with differing perspectives, backgrounds, talents, and needs, and to creating a culture rich in ideas, empowering and challenging debates, deeper commitments, and a host of educational, research, and service outcomes.

Mines produces industry-ready scientists and engineers known for their work ethic, problem-solving ability and teamwork focus. Mines graduates are in great demand by companies and government entities around the world and are invited to solve major technical and societal challenges of our times. We have several initiatives aimed at enhancing teaching and the student experience, including our reenvisioned Transfer Innovations Center, which supports best practices for teaching in large classes, and the Student Support Program, which offers academic advising, support services, and faculty to change the world through innovative thinking and entrepreneurial pursuits (https://innovations.mines.edu).

The Illinois community is in the process of developing a Strategic Plan for Diversity, Inclusion, and Access, which supports a wide range of activities, including inclusive hiring, inclusivity in the classroom, cultivating a respectful and compassionate campus culture, family friendly programming and policies, expanding pathways for success, ensuring shared responsibility (https://www.mines.edu/about/diversity-and-inclusion/).
Inclusive language in job postings

- Keep research or teaching needs broad when possible
- Describe the Dept’s commitment to DI&A
- Clearly describe the submission requirements for the application materials

Ideally you should write your evaluation rubric criteria AT THE SAME TIME as writing your job posting
Phase 2: Advertise & Outreach
Outreach

• What venues will be most productive for advertising to a broad range of potential applicants?

• How might the committee and the department engage their professional networks to encourage applications?

• How might you engage applicants from underrepresented groups?

• ACTIVE vs. Passive Recruitment
  • Use your Social media, network, professional orgs & mtgs
Attract Diverse Talent

- Job Boards: no cost to low cost, and diversity job boards to attract diverse talent.
- Find diversity job boards in your location.
- Social Media: explore the use of social media. Post, share, like or comment on LinkedIn to help expand our reach.
- Recruiting Partners: selectively leverage recruitment partners, e.g., diversity focused organizations, Alumni groups, professional organizations.
- Social Sourcing: consider who is in your network. Ensure we leverage the relationships of our colleagues.

Job Boards

Social Media

Recruiting Partners

Social Sourcing
EMPLOYER BRANDING

MAKE A DIFFERENCE IN STEM EDUCATION

Colorado School of Mines is hiring tenured/tenure-track, teaching & leadership positions for the coming year.

Departments with openings:
- Applied Mathematics & Statistics
- Chemical & Biological Engineering
- Civil & Environmental Engineering
- Computer Science
- Economics & Business
- Electrical Engineering
- Design & Society
- Geology
- Geophysics
- Materials Science
- Mechanical Engineering
- Mining Engineering

Learn more:
mines.edu/facultyrecruitment

Rankings:
1. Mineral & Mining Engineering: QS World University Rankings, 2019
4. Top 25 Brennan Colleges (1 of 23 in Colorado), Lumosity, 2019
32. Top Public Schools: U.S. News & World Report, 2019

COLORADO SCHOOL OF MINES
EARTH • ENERGY • ENVIRONMENT

Faculty Positions
Additive Manufacturing | Advanced Manufacturing | Electronic/Quantum Materials

Golden, Colorado

#2 combining scholarly research and classroom instruction by WSJ
70 faculty active in materials research
#4 best engineering college in the United States by Money Magazine in 2020

Contact Us

Colorado School of Mines (Mines) invites applications for multiple tenured/tenure-track faculty positions in three clusters (1) Computational Science and Data Analytics, (2) Advanced Manufacturing and Materials, and (3) Quantum Information, Electronic Materials, and Devices. These cluster hires are an integral part of Mines’ strategic effort to grow in areas where we already have significant strengths or where our strengths are emerging. Mines is a great place to engage in education and research in each of these areas as they relate to our Earth, Energy and Environment mission. Mines is especially interested in qualified candidates who can contribute, through their research, teaching, and service, to the diversity and excellence of the academic community.

These tenured and tenure-track positions are anticipated to begin in August 2021. In addition, the new faculty hired could be hired into one of eight departments including the Department of Metallurgical and Materials Engineering and/or could contribute to the interdisciplinary Materials Science program while housed in any department. Qualified candidates with metalurgical and materials-focused expertise in one or more of the following areas are encouraged to apply: 1) Additive manufacturing for fabrication of functional and/or structural materials, including material processing science and technology, process control, and characterization; 2) Advanced solid-state electrical and/or magnetic phenomena relevant to industrial applications; 3) Advanced materials synthesis and processing, including solid-state reactions, diffusion, and phase transformations; 4) Advanced quantum devices and systems for applications in communication, computer science, and quantum information processing; 5) Advanced methods for electronic and photonic materials and devices, including fundamental materials research, growth and modification of functional materials and devices, and device modeling; 6) Advanced methods for electronic and photonic materials and devices, including fundamental materials research, growth and modification of functional materials and devices, and device modeling; 7) Advanced methods for electronic and photonic materials and devices, including fundamental materials research, growth and modification of functional materials and devices, and device modeling; 8) Advanced methods for electronic and photonic materials and devices, including fundamental materials research, growth and modification of functional materials and devices, and device modeling.

For more information, contact Dr. Geoff Brennecka at gbrennecks@mines.edu. View complete announcements at https://jobs.mines.edu/.

recruitment@mines.edu
Phase 3: Assess & Interview
Assess

• The rubric is not a substitute for active committee deliberations
• Rubrics do not overcome implicit bias by themselves
• **BUT rubrics are one of the best ways to minimize bias**
• Review EEO report provided by HR
• Use feedback forms that are based on interview evidence only
## Materials Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching, Curriculum and Online Course Development</th>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Diversity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of teaching excellence, including application of best practices in educational pedagogies (e.g., active learning, curriculum design and improvements, and coaching innovation). Exam also includes adapting course materials, adjusting teaching style to reach different types of learners, holding special office hours to accommodate specific students, or initiating an extracurricular student development program (e.g., FE exam review, study skills, mental health, peer tutoring, etc.). Evidence of potential to teach and contribute to the development or refinement of a broad array of courses, including courses in the introductory sequence, upper-division core curriculum courses, electives, and field courses. Evidence of ability to work effectively as part of a teaching team, coordinate classes, assess classes for ABET, and effectively train and supervise TAs. Evidence of commitment to student success.</td>
<td>Potential to be a conscientious university community member (e.g., academic advisor, student club advisor, committee member).</td>
<td>Potential to contribute to diversity and inclusion in the dept. (Was the diversity statement thoughtfully written and integrated evidence based best practices?)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Research (55%)

| Potential for scholarly impact / tenureability | Evidence of potential for Entrepreneurship & Innovation | Potential to contribute to and/or generate new industry collaborations | Evidence of potential for trans-disciplinary collaboration | Add additional, Department specific criteria here | Evidence of strong background in fields that contribute to Mines research thrusts (score and include in comments all areas listed - Materials, Energy, Health, Sustainability) | Evidence of potential for online teaching experience | Potential (or Demonstrated ability) to integrate best practices in educational pedagogies into teaching (e.g., active learning) | Potential to teach the core curriculum & integrate undergrads into research | Potential to contribute to diversity and inclusion. (Was the diversity statement thoughtfully written and integrated evidence based best practices?) | Potential to be a conscientious university community member. |

### Teaching (27%)

| 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 |

### Service (18%)

| 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 |

---

**COLORADO SCHOOL OF MINES**

**Earth | Energy | Environment**

recruitment@mines.edu
Bias in the Assessment Process

- **Early Bird**
  Over valuing early applications

- **Moving Target**
  Get distracted by impressive applicant & change hiring criteria

- **Known Quantity**
  Internal applicants may have more intel & seem safer

- **Affinity Bias**
  Hiring people the same as ourselves

- **Attribution Bias**
  How we perceive the actions of others

- **Confirmation Bias**
  Interpret new evidence as confirmation of one’s existing beliefs

- **Rec Letters**
  Tend to write more professional statements about men, personal for women

- **Halo Effect**
  Perceived as having more positive traits

- **Beauty Bias**
  Judging people based on how they look
Similar results when you do the same experiment with Black sounding names, LGBTQ info, etc.
Add versus Fit
Tips on reviewing the DI&A Statement

• Notice candidates’ level of reliance on generalities, platitudes, and clichés.
  • Are their statements generic and perfunctory, or more detailed and specific to the individual?
  • Do they give concrete examples of past experiences?
  • Notice level of activity (frequency, duration)
  • Do future contributions align with Mines' needs?
Plan the Interview

- Review job description
- Prepare questions to address job essentials
- Provide department faculty with the rubric before interviews
- Divide behavioral based interview questions amongst committee members
- Be prepared to answer candidate questions, including DI&A
- Positive and candid
Facility Search - Candidate Evaluation Form

1. Last name of candidate *

Enter your answer

2. Please indicate your role: *

- Faculty
- Student
- Staff
- Administration
- Other

3. Please indicate which of the following are true for your interaction with the candidate (check all that apply): *

- Read candidate's CV
- Read teaching statement
- Read diversity statement
- Met with candidate
- Attended candidate seminar
- Previous professional interaction
- Attended lunch or dinner with candidate
- Other

4. Please provide interview evidence regarding the candidate’s teaching ability as reflected in the interview/application review.

Enter your answer

5. Please provide interview evidence regarding the candidate’s ability to contribute to research at Mines.

Enter your answer

6. Please provide interview evidence regarding the candidate’s ability to contribute to diversity and inclusion as well as service at Mines.

Enter your answer

7. Please rate the candidate from 0 to 5 on each of the following, where: 5=Excellent, 4=Good, 3=Neutral, 2=Poor, 1=Fail, 0=Unable to assess.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence of teaching ability</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of research ability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to teach the courses needed in the department</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to be a Constituency university community member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to contribute to diversity and inclusive efforts on campus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall rating</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Behavioral Based Interview Questions

Questions that focus on the candidate’s past behaviors using the concept that past behavior is a predictor of future performance

Behavioral interview question formats:

- “Explain a project that you initiated”
- “Describe a situation where you had to work with a diverse or challenging group”
- “Tell us about the largest logistical challenge you’ve ever overcome.”

Focus questions on candidates’ past behaviors that align with the position requirements.
Interviews: what not to ask

You cannot ask questions that in any way relate to a candidate's:

• Age
• Race
• Ethnicity
• Color
• Gender
• Sex
• Sexual orientation or gender identity
• Country of origin
• Birthplace
• Religion
• Disability
• Marital status
• Family status
• Pregnancy
• Salary history
Phase 4: Recruit
Making Hiring Recommendations

A successful search will make Hiring Recommendations that align with Mines@150

Writing a good hiring recommendation memo (~1pg):

• Briefly summarize candidate’s CV highlights and their research theme (See examples of themes in the rubrics).

• Describe how the candidate contributes to departmental/programmatic needs and initiatives described in your Pathways of Distinction document.

• Describe how the candidate contributes to Mines. How will they contribute to:
  • growing online MS degrees
  • industry collaborations, entrepreneurship & innovation
  • student success
  • potential for securing externally funded research and scholarly impact (i.e. tenurability)
  • diversity & inclusion

• Describe feedback from the campus visit

• Don’t gloss over a potential negative; address it and describe why the candidate should be hired and how they will be successful.
Key Takeaways

- Diversity and Inclusion matter
- Be positive and candid
- Be aware of own biases
- Use behavioral based interview questions
- Treat all candidates equally
- All documents subject to audit
- HR is here to help!
Recommended Websites:
• Mines Diversity, Inclusion & Access
• Bias Interrupters
• Catalyst: Workplaces that Work for Women
• Systematic inequality and hierarchy in faculty hiring networks

Recommended Books:
• Biased: Uncovering the Hidden Prejudice That Shapes What We See, Think, and Do.
• Blind Spot: Hidden Bias of Good People
• Overcoming Bias: Building Authentic Relationships Across Differences
• How to be an Anti-Racist

Recommended Blogs and Articles:
• How to Reduce Personal Bias When Hiring
• How to Confront People Without Alienating Them
• Seven Tips for Managing Unconscious Bias
• Tips for Rooting Out Hidden Bias
### Interview Matrix

#### For All Candidates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERVIEWER</th>
<th>DEAN</th>
<th>DH</th>
<th>CHAIRED POSITION</th>
<th>TENURED FACULTY</th>
<th>ALL RANKS TENURE-TRACK &amp; TEACHING FACULTY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>President &amp; Provost (together)</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provost (only)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vice Provost</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVP &amp; COO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>VP for Research &amp; Tech Transfer (VPRTT)</em></td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>30 min</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dean</td>
<td>60 min</td>
<td>60 min</td>
<td>60 minutes</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### For All FINAL Candidates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERVIEWER</th>
<th>DEAN</th>
<th>DH</th>
<th>CHAIRED POSITION</th>
<th>TENURED FACULTY</th>
<th>ALL RANKS TENURE-TRACK &amp; TEACHING FACULTY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>President &amp; Provost (together)</td>
<td>Above</td>
<td>Above</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVP &amp; COO</td>
<td>Above</td>
<td></td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vice Provost</td>
<td>Above</td>
<td>Above</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PageUp 101
Your Dashboard:

My Dashboard
Welcome Jennifer, this is your Dashboard where you will see all your tasks organized in various stages.

Job description
- My position description - Under review

New job
- 0 Jobs open

Search committee review
- 1 Jobs requiring panel review

Interviews
- 0 Scheduled interviews

Offers
- 0 New hires
- 0 New hire tasks

COLORADO SCHOOL OF MINES
EARTH • ENERGY • ENVIRONMENT

recruitment@mines.edu
How to Bulk Compile

Click on "View Applicants" on the right.

Note: the "total applications" number includes incomplete applications; those are not part of your view.

Select the applicants of your choice, then choose Bulk Compile and Send in the Select dialog box above the applicant names.
Select the Documents

Select applicant personal details, resume, cover letter, other – applicant, and supporting applicant documents

Click "Create PDF" at the bottom
Click to download your document; do NOT sent via PageUp

Note: To send the document, it is not necessary to download the document below. The document will be sent as an attachment with the communication below.

Your document is ready to download:
Download document (1.8 mb)

Send document:  Yes  No
Questions? Thank You